

# LANDMARK COMMISSION



Regular Meeting Minutes 2023 JUL -7 PM 3: 55

June 5, 2023

CITY SECRETARY DALLAS, TEXAS

9am Briefing 1:00pm Public Hearing 6ES Briefing Room 24829078258@dallascityhall.we bex.com, (408) 418-9388 Evelyn Montgomery, Chair

PRESENT: [15]

• 4	
Commissioner Sherman, District 1	Commissioner Hajdu, District 10
Commissioner Montgomery, District 2	Commissioner Gibson, District 11
*Commissioner Fogleman, District 3	*Commissioner Rothenberger, District 12
*Commissioner Swann, District 4	*Commissioner Slade, District 13
*Commissioner Offutt, District 5	Commissioner Guest, District 14
*Commissioner Hinojosa District 6	*Commissioner Velvin, District 15
Commissioner Livingston, III, District 7	
Commissioner Spellicy, District 8	
Commissioner Renaud, District 9	

ABSENT: [0]	 

\*Note: Members of the Landmark Commission participated in this meeting by video conference.

Chair Montgomery called the meeting to order at 9:15 a.m. with a quorum of the Landmark Commission present.

The meeting agenda, posted in accordance with Chapter 551, "OPEN MEETINGS", of the Texas Government Code, was presented.

# **PUBLIC SPEAKERS**

The Landmark Commission provided "public speaker" opportunities for individuals to comment on matters that were scheduled on the agenda or to present concerns or address issues that were not matters for consideration listed on the posted meeting agenda.

# **MEETING ACTIONS**

Chair Montgomery, called the meeting to order at 1:10p.m., with a quorum of the Landmark Commission present. Elaine Hill, Landmark Commission Coordinator, conducted a roll call.

Motion was made to approve the May 1, 2023, Regular Meeting Minutes

Maker:	Spellicy				
Second:	Swann				
Results:	15/0				
		Ayes	-	15	Fogleman, Gibson, Guest, Hajdu, Hinojosa, Livingston, Montgomery, Offutt, Renaud, Slade, Sherman, Spellicy, Swann, Rothenberger, Velvin
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:		0	
		Vacancies:	-	0	

The Chair declared the motion approved by the Landmark Commission.

Motion was made to move Discussion Item D1 to the Consent Agenda.

Maker:	Spellicy				
Second:	Hinojosa				
Results:	15/0				
		Ayes	120	15	Fogleman, Gibson, Guest, Hajdu, Hinojosa, Livingston, Montgomery, Offutt, Renaud, Slade, Sherman, Spellicy, Swann, Rothenberger, Velvin
		Against:	14	0	
		Absent:		0	
		Vacancies:	90	0	

The Chair declared the motion approved by the Landmark Commission.

Motion was made to approve Consent items C1 - C10, and D1 following Staff Recommendations.

Maker:	Spellicy				
Second:	Guest		T		
Results	15/0				
		Ayes:	-	15	Fogleman, Gibson, Guest, Hajdu, Hinojosa, Livingston, Montgomery, Offutt, Renaud, Slade, Sherman, Spellicy, Swann, Rothenberger, Velvin
		Against:	*	0	
		Absent:	=	0	
		Vacancies:		0	

The Chair declared the motion approved by the Landmark Commission.

Motion was made to re-arrange the Discussion agenda and hear Items D10, D2, D7, D8, D4, D3, D5, D6, and D9.

Maker:	Spellicy		1		
Second:	Sherman		$^{\dagger}$		
Results	15/0				
		Ayes:	-	15	Fogleman, Gibson, Guest, Hajdu, Hinojosa, Livingston, Montgomery, Offutt, Renaud, Slade, Sherman, Spellicy, Swann, Rothenberger, Velvin
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	0	
		Vacancies:		0	

The Chair declared the motion approved by the Landmark Commission.

#### **CONSENT ITEMS**

#### 1. 722 RIDGEWAY ST

Junius Heights Historic District CA223-328(CM) Christina Mankowski

That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace existing vinyl windows on second floor with Legacy 450 Series vinyl windows in the same style be **approved with the condition** that the replacement vinyl windows are of the six over one configuration in accordance with drawings and specifications dated 5/1/23. Implementation of the recommended condition would allow the proposed work to be consistent with preservation criteria Sections 5.1 and 5.3; the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) for contributing structures; and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

#### 2. 4937 SWISS AVE

Swiss Avenue Historic District CA223-329(CM) Christina Mankowski

That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace existing barn-style garage doors with new cedar wood garage doors with windows be **approved with the condition** that the doors are painted to match existing exterior and door slats are installed vertically in accordance with the drawings and specifications dated 6/5/2023. Implementation of the recommended conditions would allow the proposed work to be consistent with preservation criteria Section 51P-63.116(1)(A)(ii); the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) for contributing structures; and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

#### 3. 130 N MONTCLAIR AVE

Winnetka Historic District CA223-390(CM) Christina Mankowski

That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to enlarge existing garage to add third bay and second floor be **approved** in accordance with the drawings and specifications dated 6/5/2023. The proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Sec. 51P-87.111(a)(1); the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) for contributing structures; and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

# 4. 201 N EDGEFIELD AVE

June 5, 2023

Winnetka Historic District

CA223-394(CM)

Christina Mankowski

That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to amend previous Certificate of Appropriateness to add existing stairs from deck to yard at southeast side of rear yard be **approved** in accordance with drawings and specifications dated 6/5/2023. The proposed work is consistent with Winnetka Heights preservation criteria Sections 51P-87.111(b)(8) and (9); meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) for contributing structures; and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

#### 5. 305 S EDGEFIELD AVE

Swiss Avenue Historic District

CA223-324(CM)

Christina Mankowski

That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to remove two Elm trees in parkway and replace with two Red Oak trees be **approved** in accordance with specifications dated 6/5/2023. The proposed work is consistent with Winnetka Heights preservation criteria Section 51P-

87.111(b)(5); meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) for contributing structures; and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

#### 6. 315 N CLINTON AVE

Winnetka Historic District CA223-395(CM)

Christina Mankowski

- 1. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to expand existing front yard landscape beds and install new plants be **approved** in accordance with specifications dated 6/5/2023. The proposed work is consistent with Winnetka Heights preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(b); meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) for contributing structures; and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.
- 2. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to plant a 15G Japanese Maple and 3 white flowering Dogwood trees on south side of main structure be **approved** in accordance with specifications dated 6/5/2023. The proposed work is consistent with Winnetka Heights preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(b); meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) for contributing structures; and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

# 7. 318 N CLINTON AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic

District

CA223-396(CM)

Christina Mankowski

That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace ribbon driveway with 37 feet by 8 foot poured concrete driveway be **approved** in accordance with specifications dated 6/5/2023. The proposed work is consistent with Winnetka Heights preservation criteria Section 51P-87.111(b)(9); meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) for contributing structures; and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

## 8. 201 E 9th ST

W H Adamson High School

CA223-397(RD)

Rhonda Dunn

That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to install free standing walkway canopies on east and west elevations of accessory building be **approved** in accordance with drawings and specifications dated 5/25/23. The proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Sections 9.1 and 9.6 pertaining to new construction and additions; the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii) for

June 5, 2023

noncontributing structures; and the Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines for Setting (District/Neighborhood).

#### 9. 919 MORRELL AVE

Zion Hill Missionary Baptist Church CA223-398(RD)

Rhonda Dunn

- 1. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to repave/replace deteriorated parking area with brush finish concrete on east side of property be **approved** in accordance with drawings and specifications dated 5/4/23. The proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Sections 3,3 and 3.5 under building site and landscaping; the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) for contributing structures; and the Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines for Setting (District/Neighborhood).
- 2. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to repave/replace deteriorated sidewalk with brush finish concrete on east side of property be **approved** in accordance with drawings and specifications dated 5/4/23. The proposed work is consistent with preservation criterion Section 3.3 under building site and landscaping; the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) for contributing structures; and the Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines for Setting (District/Neighborhood).

#### 10. 4823 GASTON AVE

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic District CA223-401(RD)

Rhonda Dunn

That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to install landscaping (native plants) in front yard of main building be **approved** in accordance with drawings and specifications dated 5/18/23. The proposed work is consistent with preservation criterion Section 2.6 pertaining to site and site elements; the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii) for noncontributing structures; and the Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines for Setting (District/Neighborhood).

## **DISCUSSION ITEMS**

# 1. 6031 WORTH ST (MOVED TO CONSENT)

Junius Heights Historic District CA223-382(CM) Christina Mankowski

- 1. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to plant 8-10 foot tall Little Gem Magnolia Tree in the middle of the front yard be **approved** in accordance with specifications dated 6/5/2023. The proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 3.5; meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) for contributing structures; and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.
- 2. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to repaint exterior of main and accessory structures trim in the color SW7005 "Pure White" be **approved**. The proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 4.4; meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) for contributing structures; and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.
- 3. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to paint brick and wood exterior of accessory structure in the color SW7016 "Mindful Gray" be **approved**. The proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 4.1(e); meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) for contributing structures; and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

4. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to A Certificate of Appropriateness to install cement walkway and steps from porch to sidewalk be **approved**. The proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 3.2; meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) for contributing structures; and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

#### 2. 612 E 5TH ST

Lake Cliff Historic District CA223-384(CM)

A Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a new multi-family planned development.

Speakers:

For:

Braylon Lester

Against:

No Speakers

#### Motion

That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a new multi-family planned development be **denied without prejudice**. The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii) for noncontributing structures, and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

Maker:	Renaud		T		
Second	Sherman				
Results:	15/0				
		Ayes:	i ca	15	Fogleman, Gibson, Guest, Hajdu, Hinojosa, Livingston, Montgomery, Offutt, Renaud, Slade, Sherman, Spellicy, Swann, Rothenberger, Velvin
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	0	
		Vacancies:		0	

The Chair declared the motion denied without prejudice by the Landmark Commission and stated that if the applicant feels that the Landmark Commission errored in their decision, may appeal the decision with the City Plan Commission for a fee

# 3. 4912 JUNIUS ST

Munger Place Historic District CA223-385(CM)

Christina Mankowski

- 1. A Certificate of Appropriateness to remove existing side door and adjacent window and replace with a new wood door with a stained-glass window.
- 2. A Certificate of Appropriateness to remove existing rear windows and replace with a new casement window and to repair and replace surrounding siding to match existing.

Speakers:

For:

Liz Gipson

Against:

No Speakers

# Motion

1. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to remove existing side door and adjacent window and replace with a new wood door with a stained-glass window be **approved** in accordance with specifications dated 5/3/2023. The proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 51P-97.111(c)(1)(S); meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) for contributing structures; and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

2. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to remove existing rear windows and replace with a new casement window and to repair and replace surrounding siding to match existing be **approved** in accordance with specifications dated 5/3/2023. The proposed work is consistent with preservation criteria Section 51P-97.111(c)(1)(S); meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) for contributing structures; and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

Maker:	Hinojosa				
Second:	Renaud		$\dagger$		
Results:	15/0				
		Ayes:	-	15	Fogleman, Gibson, Guest, Hajdu, Hinojosa, Livingston, Montgomery, Offutt, Renaud, Slade, Sherman, Spellicy, Swann, Rothenberger, Velvin
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:		0	
		Vacancies:	-	0	

The Chair declared the motion approved by the Landmark Commission,

#### 4. 5203 VICTOR ST

Junius Heights Historic District CA223-386(CM)

Christina Mankowski

- 1. A Certificate of Appropriateness to build main structure.
- 2. A Certificate of Appropriateness to build detached garage.
- 3. A Certificate of Appropriateness to replace rear yard fence.
- 4. A Certificate of Appropriateness to install landscaping in front yard.

Speakers:	For:	Douglas Seibel

Against: No Speakers

#### Motion

- 1. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to build main structure be **denied without prejudice**.
- 2. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to build detached garage be **denied without prejudice**.
- 3. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to install fence and gate be **denied without prejudice**. The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii) for noncontributing structures, and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.
- 4. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to install landscaping in front yard be **approved** in accordance with specifications dated 4/14/2023. The proposed work meets the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii) for noncontributing structures, and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

Maker:	Sherman	
Second:	Renaud	
Results:	15/0	

June 5, 2023

Ayes:	=	15	Fogleman, Gibson, Guest, Hajdu, Hinojosa, Livingston, Montgomery, Offutt, Renaud, Slade, Sherman, Spellicy, Swann, Rothenberger, Velvin
Against:	-	0	
Absent:	-	0	
 Vacancies:	-	0	

The Chair declared the motion partially approved by the Landmark Commission and stated that if the applicant feels that the Landmark Commission errored in their decision, may appeal the decision with the City Plan Commission for a fee.

#### 5. 5211 JUNIUS ST

Munger Place Historic District CA223-387(CM)

Christina Mankowski

- 1. A Certificate of Appropriateness to add additional 8-foot X 8-foot post with 4-foot concrete base for structural strength.
- 2. A Certificate of Appropriateness to add concrete base from house to driveway.
- 3. A Certificate of Appropriateness to add staircase base.
- 4. A Certificate of Appropriateness to change railing from metal to cedar.

Speakers:

For:

Johnathan Rankin

Against:

No Speakers

#### Motion

- 1. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to add additional 8-foot X 8-foot post with 4-foot concrete base for structural strength be **approved** in accordance with drawings and specification dated 6/5/2023. The proposed work is consistent with Munger Place preservation criteria Sections 51P-97.111(c)(1)(B) for additions; City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) for contributing structures; and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.
- 2. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to add concrete base be **approved** in accordance with drawings and specification dated 6/5/2023. The proposed work is consistent with Munger Place preservation criteria Sections 51P-97.111(c)(1)(B) for additions; City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) for contributing structures; and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.
- 3. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to add staircase base be **approved** in accordance with drawings and specification dated 6/5/2023. The proposed work is consistent with Munger Place preservation criteria Sections 51P-97.111(c)(1)(B) for additions; City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) for contributing structures; and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.
- 4. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to change railing from metal to cedar and paint white per previously **approved** Certificate of Appropriateness be approved in accordance with drawings and specifications dated 6/5/23. The proposed work is consistent with Munger Place preservation criteria Sections 51P-97.111(c)(1)(B) for additions and 51P-97.111(c)(1)(I) for color; City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) for contributing structures; and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

Maker:	Renaud				
Second:	Sherman				
Results:	15/0				
		Ayes:		15	Fogleman, Gibson, Guest, Hajdu, Hinojosa, Livingston, Montgomery, Offutt, Renaud, Slade, Sherman, Spellicy, Swann, Rothenberger, Velvin
		Against:	-	0	

June 5, 2023

Abse	ent:	-	0	
Vaca	ancies:	-	0	

The Chair declared the motion approved by the Landmark Commission.

#### 6. 218 N WILLOMET AVE

Winnetka Heights Historic District CA223-393(CM)

Christina Mankowski

1. A Certificate of Appropriateness to replace siding on entire property.

2. A Certificate of Appropriateness to add rear deck.

Speakers:

For:

No Speakers

Against:

No Speakers

#### Motion

1. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace siding on entire property be **denied without prejudice**. The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii) for noncontributing structures, and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

2. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to add rear deck be **denied without prejudice**. The proposed work does not meet the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(ii) for noncontributing

structures, and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards.

Maker:	Swann				
Second:	Sherman		T		
Results:	15/0				
	-	Ayes:	=	15	Fogleman, Gibson, Guest, Hajdu, Hinojosa, Livingston, Montgomery, Offutt, Renaud, Slade, Sherman, Spellicy, Swann, Rothenberger, Velvin
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	2	0	
		Vacancies:	=	0	

The Chair declared the motion denied without prejudice by the Landmark Commission and stated that if the applicant feels that the Landmark Commission errored in their decision, may appeal the decision with the City Plan Commission for a fee.

#### 7. 4702 SWISS AVE

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic District CA223-400(RD)

Rhonda Dunn

A Certificate of Appropriateness to construct new two-story accessory structure (a garage) in rear yard.

Speakers:

For:

Michael Grable

Against

No Speakers

#### Motion

That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct new two-story accessory structure (a garage) in rear yard be **approved** in accordance with drawings and specifications dated 5/4/23 **with the following conditions**: that exterior board and batten siding be all wood and that windows be all wood framed. Implementation of the recommended conditions would allow the proposed work to be consistent with preservation criteria Sections 4.1, 4.2, and 4.3 pertaining to new construction and additions; the standards in

City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) for contributing structures; and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

Maker:	Sherman				
Second:	Swann		+		
Results:	14/1				
		Ayes:		14	Fogleman, Gibson, Guest, Hajdu, Hinojosa, Livingston, Offutt, Renaud, Slade, Sherman, Spellicy, Swann, Rothenberger, Velvin
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:		1	Montgomery
		Vacancies:	-	0	

Commissioner Montgomery did not hear or vote on this item

The Vice Chair declared the motion approved with conditions by the Landmark Commission.

#### 8. 4702 SWISS AVE

Peak's Suburban Addition Neighborhood Historic District CD223-009(RD)

Rhonda Dunn

A Certificate of Demolition to demolish accessory structure (a garage). Standard: Demolition of noncontributing structure because newer than period of significance.

Speakers:

For:

Michael Grable

Against:

No Speakers

#### Motion

That the request for a Certificate of Demolition to demolish accessory structure (a garage) be **approved** in accordance with specifications dated 5/4/23. The proposed work is consistent with the standards in City Code Section 51A-4.501(h)(4)(D).

Maker:	Hinojos <b>a</b>				
Second	Guest		+		
Results:	14/0				
		Ayes:	:=	14	Fogleman, Gibson, Guest, Hajdu, Hinojosa, Livingston, Offutt, Renaud, Slade, Sherman, Spellicy, Swann, Rothenberger, Velvin
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	1	Montgomery
		Vacancies:		0	

Commissioner Montgomery did not hear or vote on this item

The Chair declared the motion approved by the Landmark Commission.

# 9. 1129 BETTERTON CIR

Tenth Street Neighborhood Historic District CA223-403(RD)

Rhonda Dunn

A Certificate of Appropriateness to install solar panels on east (right) side of roof.

Speakers:

For:

No Speakers

Against:

No Speakers

# Motion

That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to install solar panels on east (right) side of roof be **denied** without prejudice. The proposed work is inconsistent with preservation criterion Section (c) under roofs; the standards in City Code Section 51A-4,501(g)(6)(C)(i) for contributing structures; and the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation.

Maker:	Swann				
Second:	Guest				
Results:	13/1		İ		
		Ayes:		13	Fogleman, Gibson, Guest, Hajdu, Hinojosa, Montgomery, Offutt, Renaud, Slade, Sherman, Swann, Rothenberger, Velvin
		Against:	(m)	1	Spellicy
		Absent:		1	Livingston
		Vacancies:	•	0	

Commissioner Livingston did not vote on this item.

The Chair declared the motion denied without prejudice by the Landmark Commission and stated that if the applicant feels that the Landmark Commission errored in their decision, may appeal the decision with the City Plan Commission for a fee.

#### 10. 4107 TURTLE CREEK BLVD

Burgher Residence

Rhonda Dunn

A Landmark Commission Authorized Hearing to consider a historic overlay for the Burgher Residence, on the west side of Turtle Creek Boulevard south of Wycliff Avenue.

Speakers:

For

David Preziosi

Against:

No Speakers

#### Motion

Approve the request to consider a historic overlay for the Burgher Residence.

Maker:	Guest				
Second:	Sherman				
Results:	15/0		$\top$		
		Ayes:		15	Fogleman, Gibson, Guest, Hajdu, Hinojosa, Livingston, Montgomery, Offutt, Renaud, Slade, Sherman, Spellicy, Swann, Rothenberger, Velvin
		Against:	-	0	
		Absent:	-	0	
		Vacancies:	-	0	

The Chair declared the motion approved by the Landmark Commission

# **ADJOURNMENT**

After all business of the Landmark Commission had been considered, the Chair adjourned the meeting at 2:48 p.m.

Drafted by:

Elaine Hill, Landmark Commission Coordinator

Office of Historic Preservation

Approved by:

Evelyn Montgomery, Chair Landmark Commission

12/02

Date