Legislation Text

File #: 26-3158A, **Version:** 1

AGENDA DATE:	October 5, 2026
COUNCIL DISTRICT:	D2
HISTORIC DISTRICT:	Peak's Suburban Addition (H/72)
DEPARTMENT:	Department of Planning and Development

SUBJECT

4616 GASTON AVENUE

Council District 2

Peak's Suburban Addition Historic District
COA-26-000492
Christina Paress

Request

1. A Certificate of Appropriateness to replace all windows with all wood one-over-one windows in the same dimensions as original windows.
2. A Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a rear addition on the main structure.
3. A Certificate of Appropriateness to enclose the front porch.
4. A Certificate of Appropriateness to replace a second front door and awning with a new wood window.
5. A Certificate of Appropriateness to replace existing architectural shingled roof on the main structure with DaVinci Composite slate roofing in the color "Matte Black".
6. A Certificate of Appropriateness to install a new nine (9) foot board-on-board wood fence.
7. A Certificate of Appropriateness to install new landscaping in front, rear, and side yards.
8. A Certificate of Appropriateness to change paint color on main structure: Wood paneling and shingle siding at gables and second-floor enclosed front balcony - Benjamin Moore" Wrought Iron", Trim, fascia and structural framing - Benjamin Moore" Black", and Windows and exterior doors -" Architectural Black".

Applicant Ryan McNee

Application Filed INCOMPLETE

Staff Recommendation

1. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace all windows with all wood one over windows in the same dimensions as original windows be **approved with the following conditions**: a.) that the replacement windows on the front façade match the same top premier style configuration as the original windows; b.) all side and rear windows are a one-over-one configuration; and c.) any brick and mortar removed during replacement is reinstalled and restored to its original placement, configuration, consistency, tooling, and color. Implementation

of the proposed condition would allow the proposed work to be consistent with preservation criteria Section 3.10; City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) for **contributing** structures; and/or the Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines for Rehabilitation.

2. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a rear addition on main structure be **denied without prejudice** with a finding of fact that the application is incomplete and lacks complete architectural plans and drawings.
3. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to enclose front porch be **denied without prejudice** with the finding of fact that enclosed porches are not permitted on protected facades and submitted architectural plans and drawings are incomplete. Therefore, the proposed work would have an adverse effect on the structure and is not consistent with preservation criteria Section 3.19; City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) for **contributing** structures; and/or the Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines for Rehabilitation.
4. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace second front door and awning with new wood window be **denied without prejudice** with the findings of fact that the structure was built as a duplex and the second door and awning are original to the main structure. The proposed work would, therefore, have an adverse effect on the structure and is not consistent with preservation criteria Section 3.10 and 3.19; City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) for **contributing** structures; and/or the Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines for Rehabilitation.
5. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace existing architectural shingled roof on main structure with DaVinci Composite slate roofing in the color "Matte Black" be **denied without prejudice** with the finding of fact that the proposed material and color are not original or appropriate to the main structure and would have an adverse effect on structure and the historic district. Therefore, the proposed work is not consistent with preservation criteria Section 3.16 and 3.17; City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) for **contributing** structures; and/or the Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines for Rehabilitation.
6. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to install new nine (9) foot board on board wood fence be **approved with the condition** that the fence portions facing Gaston Avenue be 70% open and design submitted to staff for approval. Implementation of the proposed condition would allow the proposed work to be consistent with preservation criteria Section 2.11; City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) for **contributing** structures; and/or the Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines for Setting (District/Neighborhood).
7. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to install new landscaping in front, rear, and side yards be **denied without prejudice** with the finding of fact that the proposed trees and bamboo are not appropriate or typical to the historic district and would have an adverse effect on the property and historic district. The proposed work is, therefore, not consistent with preservation criteria Section 2.6; City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) for **contributing** structures; and/or the Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines for Setting (District/Neighborhood).
8. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to change paint color on main structure: Wood paneling and shingle siding at gables and second-floor enclosed front balcony - Benjamin Moore" Wrought Iron", Trim, fascia and structural framing - Benjamin Moore" Black", and Windows and exterior doors -" Architectural Black" be **denied without prejudice** with the finding of fact that the paint colors do not comply with the Munsell Color Chart. Therefore, the proposed work is not consistent with preservation criteria Section 3.7; City Code Section 51A-4.501(g)(6)(C)(i) for **contributing** structures; and/or the Secretary of the Interior's Guidelines for Rehabilitation.

Task Force Recommendation

powered by Legistar™

1. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace all windows with all wood one over windows in the same dimensions as original windows be approved with the following conditions:
   - Replacement windows must be the exact size as the existing windows.
   - Windows must be one over one configuration.
   - Replacement windows must be in the same locations as the existing windows.
   - Windows must be wood-on-wood and not aluminum clad.
   - Any brickwork necessary to square the rough openings must use existing brick and must not alter the dimensions of the existing rough openings or the approved window sizes.
2. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a rear addition on main structure be:
   - **Plate Glass Windows - First Floor** Approve as submitted, with the condition that the window frames be wood-on-wood and not aluminum-clad.
   - **Pivot Doors / Center Windows - First Floor** Approve as submitted, with the condition that the window frames be wood-on-wood and not aluminum-clad.
   - **Second Floor Balcony -** Deny without prejudice: No dimensions were provided, no materials submitted.
   - **Plate Glass Windows** Deny without prejudice. Plate glass windows are not appropriate to the architectural character of the house. The Task Force recommends ganged windows similar in configuration to the other ganged windows on the house, using the submitted window dimensions of the larger original windows.
   - **Window Alignment** the Task Force encourages alignment of the first- and second-story windows on the rear half of the façade to reinforce the architectural rhythm and proportions of the existing structure.
3. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to enclose front porch and facade be:
   - **Enclosure of Front Porch - First Floor** Deny without prejudice. Front porches are a defining and characteristic architectural feature of the neighborhood and are particularly important to the architectural character of Prairie-style houses. The Task Force recommends retaining the open front porch configuration.
   - **Front Door and Transoms** Deny without prejudice. The existing configuration of the original single front door and double transom windows should be retained unless the applicant can provide documentation demonstrating that this is not the original configuration.
   - **Frieze Board and Apron Board - Second Floor of Porch** The frieze board and apron board surrounding the second floor of the porch must be shown and dimensioned on the plans and must retain the same dimensions as the existing elements.
   - **Second-Floor Porch** the Task Force encourages the applicant to restore the second floor of the porch to its original open configuration rather than enclosing it.
   - **Siding / Cedar Shakes** The plans must clearly identify all locations on each façade where siding or cedar shakes are proposed to be added, replaced, or modified.
   - **Front Door Hardware** Deny without prejudice. The proposed hardware is too modern in appearance and is not compatible with the historic architectural character of the house. More historically appropriate hardware should be submitted.
   - **Lighting** Deny without prejudice. The proposed light fixtures are too modern in appearance and are not compatible with the historic architectural character of the house. Historically appropriate fixtures should be submitted.
4. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace second front door and awning with

new wood window be:

- **Removal of Accessory Door / Replacement with Window - Left Side of Façade** Approve, with the following conditions:
  a. The replacement window must be the same dimensions as the window directly above it.
  b. The window must be wood-on-wood and not aluminum-clad.
  c. The window must be a one-over-one configuration.
- **Awning Over Accessory Door** The awning over the accessory door must be removed in conjunction with removal of the door.

5. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace existing architectural shingled roof on main structure with DaVinci Composite slate roofing in the color “Matte Black” be:
   - **Existing Gables** Existing gables and their architectural detailing must remain intact. If deterioration or rot requires replacement, the gables must be rebuilt to match the existing configuration and detail exactly.
   - **Roof Pitch and Overhang** The existing roof pitch and 24-inch overhang must be retained.
   - **Roof Shingles - DaVinci Slate** Approve the use of DaVinci Slate shingles. Deny without prejudice the proposed Matte Black color, as it is not typical of the architectural character of the district. A color more consistent with the historic character of the district should be submitted.
6. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to install new landscaping in front, rear, and side yards be approved as submitted.
7. That the request for a Certificate of Appropriateness to change paint color on main structure: Wood paneling and shingle siding at gables and second-floor enclosed front balcony - Benjamin Moore” Wrought Iron”, Trim, fascia and structural framing - Benjamin Moore” Black”, and Windows and exterior doors -” Architectural Black” be:
   Paint Colors Deny without prejudice. The proposed paint colors do not fall within the approved Munsell color scale. The applicant should submit revised colors that comply with the applicable approved Munsell scale.